

Sample Rubric 1: Narrative Writing with Generative AI

Criteria	Excellent (4)	Proficient (3)	Needs Improvement (2)	Unsatisfactory (1)
Creativity and Originality	Demonstrates excellent creativity, with a unique, well-developed narrative. The AI-generated elements blend seamlessly with the student's ideas.	Demonstrates creativity with an interesting narrative. AI-generated elements are incorporated well but may feel slightly disconnected at times.	Narrative shows some creativity, but AI-generated elements feel out of place or lack originality.	Narrative lacks creativity or feels entirely reliant on AI-generated content with minimal student input.
Integration of AI	Student effectively uses AI as a creative partner, integrating AI-generated suggestions smoothly and appropriately throughout the narrative.	AI is used well in key moments of the narrative, but some sections could benefit from further refinement or a stronger connection to student ideas.	AI is used inconsistently, with some parts of the narrative feeling either overly reliant on AI or disconnected from the student's voice.	AI-generated content dominates the narrative with little to no personal input, or AI is not integrated at all.
Story Structure and Coherence	Narrative is well-structured, with clear beginning, middle, and end. Transitions are smooth, and the AI-generated content supports the overall flow of the story.	Narrative is well-structured, but transitions may be awkward in some places, or AI-generated content slightly disrupts the flow.	Narrative structure is weak, with unclear transitions or parts where AI-generated content detracts from coherence.	Narrative structure is unclear or confusing, and AI-generated content disrupts the flow of the story.
Reflection on AI Use	Includes a thoughtful reflection on how AI was used in the creative process, explaining decisions and challenges in the partnership.	Reflection is clear, but lacks some depth or fails to fully explain how AI influenced specific parts of the narrative.	Reflection is brief or only partially addresses the role of AI in the creative process.	No reflection on AI use, or the reflection is vague and lacks any real insight.

Sample Rubric 2: Persuasive Essay with Generative AI Assistance

Criteria	Excellent (4)	Proficient (3)	Needs Improvement (2)	Unsatisfactory (1)
Argument and Analysis	The essay presents a clear, strong, and well-supported argument. AI-generated ideas are integrated meaningfully to strengthen the argument.	The argument is clear and well-supported, with AI-generated ideas enhancing the analysis. Some areas could benefit from deeper exploration.	The argument is weak or underdeveloped. AI-generated content is used but does not fully support the argument or analysis.	The argument is unclear or unsupported. AI-generated content is either irrelevant or not integrated into the essay.
Integration of AI	AI is used as a creative partner to enhance the argument. Suggestions are incorporated seamlessly and critically examined for relevance.	AI-generated ideas are incorporated into the essay with some analysis, but the connection to the argument may not be fully developed in some places.	AI is used but not critically evaluated. The connection to the argument is superficial, and some content feels forced or irrelevant.	AI-generated content is either not used or is simply inserted without relevance to the argument or lacking critical engagement.
Evidence and Support	The essay includes well-chosen, varied evidence that is directly linked to the argument. AI-generated evidence is appropriately incorporated and analyzed.	The essay includes adequate evidence, but some AI-generated evidence may not be as well-integrated or analyzed.	Evidence is weak or not clearly tied to the argument. AI-generated evidence lacks sufficient explanation or relevance.	Little or no evidence is provided, or AI-generated evidence is irrelevant or unsubstantiated.
Reflection on AI Use	The reflection is thorough and thoughtful, explaining how AI was used as a partner in shaping the argument and the rationale for using specific AI-generated content.	The reflection is clear but could offer more depth or detail regarding AI's role in the argument's development.	The reflection is superficial or does not adequately explain how AI influenced the writing process.	No reflection on AI use, or the reflection lacks insight into the role of AI.

Sample Rubric 3: Research Paper with AI-Assisted Writing

Criteria	Excellent (4)	Proficient (3)	Needs Improvement (2)	Unsatisfactory (1)
Research Depth and Relevance	Demonstrates deep, comprehensive research with well-chosen sources. AI was used to suggest sources, but the student critically evaluated and selected the best material.	The research is solid, with a variety of relevant sources. Some sources may have been suggested by AI but are effectively evaluated by the student.	Research is somewhat shallow, with limited or poorly integrated sources. AI suggestions may be used without careful evaluation or critical thinking.	The paper lacks sufficient or relevant research. AI-generated suggestions are used uncritically or not incorporated properly.
Synthesis and Argument	The paper presents a well-organized, coherent argument. AI-generated content is seamlessly integrated and contributes meaningfully to the synthesis of ideas.	The argument is clear, but the integration of AI-generated content is somewhat uneven or requires more depth in synthesis.	The argument lacks clarity or depth. AI-generated content does not fully contribute to the synthesis of ideas, or the paper feels fragmented.	The paper lacks a clear argument. AI-generated content either dominates or disrupts the flow of the paper without contributing to the synthesis of ideas.
Writing and Style	The writing is clear, engaging, and sophisticated. AI-generated content maintains the student's voice and is polished to a high standard.	The writing is clear and coherent, but some areas lack fluidity or style. AI-generated content is appropriately incorporated but may affect the tone or style.	Writing is unclear, repetitive, or awkward. AI-generated content impacts the clarity or voice of the paper.	Writing is poorly structured or incoherent. AI-generated content is disjointed, with no clear connection to the student's writing.
Reflection on AI Use	The student provides a detailed reflection on how AI was used in the research and writing process, including the decision-making behind AI-generated content.	The reflection is thoughtful and explains the use of AI, though it may not be as detailed or specific about the AI's role.	The reflection is brief or lacks clear analysis of how AI was used in the process.	There is no reflection on AI use, or it lacks insight into how AI contributed to the writing process.